Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 1 of 35

[DO NOT PUBLISH]

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE ELEVENTH CIRCUIT

No. 15-12340

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

BEVERLY JONES, STEVE JONES,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM, d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

PROCTER AND GAMBLE COMPANY,
PROCTER AND GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC, THE,
PROCTER AND GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12391

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 2 of 35

In re-	DENTUR	F CRFAM	PRODUC'	TS I IARII	ITVI	ITIGATION.
III IC.	DENIUN		INODUC	וועהום טו	_11 1 1 1	HIOTHON.

DONALD KIMBALL,
JAMES R. WILKERSON,
MARIE WILKERSON,
BOBBY COCKRILL,
BETTY COCKRILL,
DENICE SEDLACEK,
MICHAEL SEDLACEK,
WILLIAM M. KEITH,
Individually and as Executor de son
Tort of The Estate of Linda Sakcriska,
CORBITT CARTER,
OPAL CARTER,
DEBORAH G. JONES,
ALAN J. JONES,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12393

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 3 of 35

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation. MRS. CHRISTY HARDING, MR. DAVID HARDING, her husband, Plaintiffs - Appellants, versus THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY, Defendants - Appellees. No. 15-12419 D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation. RAYMOND ENGLISH, THERESA ENGLISH, Plaintiffs - Appellants, versus THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 4 of 35

Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12420
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.
ELLENIE STEELE,
Plaintiff - Appellant,
versus
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,
Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12421
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 5 of 35

DOROTHY	GIBSON,
---------	---------

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12422

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

ANNE M. COFFMAN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 6 of 35

	No. 15-12424		
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA			
In Re: Denture Cream Produ	cts Liability Litigation.		
PEGGY ANN SMITH-LLO	YD,		
	Plaintif	ff - Appellant,	
versus			
PROCTER & GAMBLE DIS PROCTER & GAMBLE MA		NY,	
	Defend	lants - Appellees.	
	No. 15-12427		
D.C. D	ocket No. 1:09-md-02051-0	CMA	
In Re: Denture Cream Produ	cts Liability Litigation.		
FAYE G. HOBSON,			

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 7 of 35

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

versus		
PROCTER & GAMBLE DE THE PROCTER & GAME		
		Defendants - Appellees.
		
	No. 15-12433	
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-	·02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ducts Liability Litigati	on.
BARBARA SUE MENDE	NHALL,	
		Plaintiff - Appellant,
versus		
PROCTER & GAMBLE D PROCTER & GAMBLE N		
		Defendants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12434	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 8 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liabiltiy Litigation.
ROBERT DONALD LANE, SHARON GAY LANE, as the Administrator for the Estate of Robert Donald Lane,
Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus
PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,
Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12436
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.
JENNIFER J. CORNETT, ROBERT L. CORNETT,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 9 of 35

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,	
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPAN	Y.

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,		
	Defendants - Appellees.	
_	No. 15-12437	
D.C. D	Oocket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA	
In Re: Denture Cream Produ	acts Liability Litigation.	
ROBIN ANN EVANS,		
	Plaintiff - Appellant,	
versus		
THE PROCTER & GAMBI THE PROCTER & GAMBI	LE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, LE MANUFACTURING CO.,	
	Defendants - Appellees.	
	No. 15-12449	
D.C. D	Oocket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 10 of 35

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Lit	igation.
RHONDA JOLENE SHUMATE, BRIAN SHUMATE,	
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUT THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACT	
	Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12	2450
D.C. Docket No. 1:09	-md-02051-CMA
In re: Denture Cream Products Liability Liti	gation.
PAUL CAMPIONE, MAE CAMPIONE,	
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUT: THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACT	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 11 of 35

	Defendants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12451
D.0	C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Pr	oducts Liability Litigation.
ANGELA COUCH, BARRY COUCH, Indiv Couch,	idually and as Administrator of the Estate of Angela
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	
	MBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, MBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,
	Defendants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12456
D.0	C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 12 of 35

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litiga	tion. –
JUDY SIMPSON SAMMONS, ROBERT TURNER SAMMONS,	
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	
SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al,	
	Defendants,
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURE	
	Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-1245	7
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-mo	d-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litiga	tion. —
DORA ANNETTE ROWLEN,	
	Plaintiff,
CARLTON ROWLEN,	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 13 of 35

Administrator of the Estate of Dora A. Rowlen,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12462

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

CYNTHIA A. WILLIAMS,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 14 of 35

	No. 15-12465	
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-0	CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ducts Liability Litigation.	
JAMES BYLES,		
	Plaintit	ff - Appellant,
versus		
	BLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, BLE MANUFACTURING CO BLE COMPANY,	.,
	Defend	lants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12467	
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-0	CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ducts Liability Litigation.	
DAVID HOFFMAN		

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 15 of 35

\boldsymbol{C}	٨	D	\cap	١T	Λ	1	Н	\cap	$\mathbf{F}\mathbf{F}$	$\sqrt{15}$	ſ٨	N.
$oldsymbol{ol}}}}}}}}}}}}}}}$		Λ	U	ıL	1)	Ί.	п	v	T,T	'IV.	\mathbf{L}	uΝ.

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12470

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

DIANE DE HAVEN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 16 of 35

	No. 15-12471				
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA					
In Re: Denture Cream Pro	ducts Liability Litigati	on.			
BRIAN L. STEINE,					
		Plaintiff - Appellant,			
versus					
THE PROCTER & GAMI THE PROCTER & GAMI THE PROCTER & GAMI	BLE MANUFACTUR				
		Defendants - Appellees.			
	No. 15-12473				
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-	-02051-CMA			
In Re: Denture Cream Pro	ducts Liability Litigati	on.			
JUDITH SULLIVAN,					

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 17 of 35

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO..

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12475

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

LEE RUSSO, ANDREW RUSSO,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 18 of 35

Defendants - Appellees.						
No. 15-12476						
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA						
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.						
HERSHEL BIFFLE,						
Plaintiff,						
FELECIA BIFFLE, individually and as Administratrix of the Estate of Hershel Biffle,						
Plaintiff - Appellant,						
versus						
SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,						
Defendants,						
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,						
Defendants - Appellees.						

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 19 of 35

No. 15-12477

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

KATHERINE B. MEHROFF,

Plaintiff,

DAVID L. MEHRHOFF, Individually and as Executor of the Estate of Katherine Mehrhoff,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 20 of 35

	No. 15-12478				
D.C. Doc	eket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA				
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.					
MELISSA J. BABB, THOMAS R. BABB,					
versus	Plaintiffs - Appellants,				
SMITHKLINE BEECHAM Cod.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,	ORPORATION,				
	Defendants,				
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE THE PROCTER & GAMBLE					
	Defendants - Appellees.				
	No. 15-12480				
D.C. Doc	eket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA				

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 21 of 35

MISTY DAWN JORDAN,	
	Plaintiff,
JOHNNY R. ELLZY, as the Administrator of the Estate of Misty Dawn Jordan,	
	Plaintiff - Appellant,
versus	
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURE	•
	Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12481	
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-	02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation	on.
SHAWN RENAY RANKIN, MAX RANKIN,	
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 22 of 35

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,
Defendants,
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,
Defendants - Appellees.
No. 15-12484
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.
JOYCE LUNNE HARRELL, RICK A. HARRELL,
Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

22

Defendants - Appellees.

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 23 of 35

No. 15-12485

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

HEIDI SUE WEBER, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

STEPHANIE FUS, as the Administratrix of the Estate of Heidi Sue Weber,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12486

Case: 15-12451	Date Filed: 06/15/2016	Page: 24 of 35
D.C. Do	ocket No. 1:09-md-0205	— 1-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

TENA R. THORN,

Plaintiff,

BRENT TYLER URBAN, individually and as Administrator of the Estate of Tena R. Thorn, deceased,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12490

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 25 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liabiltiy Litigation.
MARY LOU SMITH-BROXTON,
Plaintiff - Appellant, versus
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,
Defendants - Appellee
No. 15-12491
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.
CHRISTINA BALLMAN,
Plaintiff - Appellant,
versus
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 26 of 35

Defendant	ts - Appellees.
No. 15-12492	
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CM	Ā
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.	
SHARI BAKER GARRISON,	
Plaintiff -	Appellant,
versus	
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO., THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,	
Defendant	ts - Appellees.
No. 15-12493	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 27 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.				
WILLIAM R. WILLIS,	_			
	Plaintiff - Appellant,			
versus				
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURI THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,				
	Defendants - Appellees.			
No. 15-12494				
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-	02051-CMA			
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation	on.			
ANN CLAIR,				
	Plaintiff - Appellant,			
versus				
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING,	LLC,			

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 28 of 35

THE PROCTER & GAI	MBLE	CON	ЛΡΑΝΊ	Ι.
-------------------	------	-----	-------	----

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,		
		Defendants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12495	
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-0)2051-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ducts Liability Litigatio	n.
JANICE LYNN KERR, HARVEL KERR,		
		Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus		
THE PROCTER & GAME THE PROCTER & GAME THE PROCTER & GAME	BLE MANUFACTURII	
		Defendants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12499	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 29 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.		
PETER MICHAEL BASSIN,		
	Plaintiff - Appellant,	
versus		
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURE THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,		
	Defendants - Appellees.	
No. 15-1250	0	
D.C. Docket No. 1:09-mo	d-02051-CMA	
In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litiga	tion.	
ANNA JANE BAKER,		
	Plaintiff - Appellant,	
versus		
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING	G, LLC,	

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 30 of 35

ζ,
ĺ

THE FROCTER & CAMIL	DLE COMPANT,	
	Defend	dants - Appellees.
	No. 15-12501	
D.C.	Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-	CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ducts Liability Litigation.	
GENE GOSNELL,		
	Plainti	ff - Appellant,
versus		
	BLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, BLE MANUFACTURING CO BLE COMPANY,).,
	Defend	dants - Appellees.
		-
	No. 15-12502	-

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 31 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.		
PEGGY L. SINGLETON,		
	Plaintiff - Appellant,	
versus		
	LE DISTRIBUTING, LLC, LE MANUFACTURING CO., LE COMPANY,	
	Defendants - Appellees.	
	No. 15-12503	
D.C.	Oocket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA	
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	ucts Liability Litigation.	
JAMES L. ATKINSON, TANA S. ATKINSON,		
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,	
versus		

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 32 of 35

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

THE TROCTER & GAIND		ndants - Appellees.
	Dele	ndunts Tippenees.
-	No. 15-12504	
D.C. 1	Docket No. 1:09-md-02051	-CMA
In Re: Denture Cream Prod	lucts Liability Litigation.	
DORETHA GILES,		
	Plair	tiff - Appellant,
versus		
	LE DISTRIBUTING, LLC LE MANUFACTURING O LE COMPANY,	
	Defe	ndants - Appellees.
-		_
	No. 15-12505	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 33 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation	on.
EFRAIN RODRIGUEZ, IRENE FELIZ SEGURA,	
	Plaintiffs - Appellants,
versus	
SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, d.b.a. Glaxosmithkline, et al.,	
	Defendants,
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURI THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,	
	Defendants - Appellees.
No. 16-10130	

Case: 15-12451 Date Filed: 06/15/2016 Page: 34 of 35

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

BENJAMIN BERMAN, CHRISTOPHER D. BIRD, SR., JOSEPH DAVIS, III,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,

Defendants - Appellees.

Appeals from the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida

(June 15, 2016)

Before WILSON and JULIE CARNES, Circuit Judges, and WOOD,* District Judge.

PER CURIAM:

This appeal consolidates forty-eight individual appeals arising out of multidistrict litigation in *In re Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation*, 1:09-md-02051-CMA. In their complaints, Plaintiffs alleged that Defendants produced

^{*} Honorable Lisa Godbey Wood, United States District Chief Judge for Southern District of Georgia, sitting by designation.

a denture cream that caused Plaintiffs to develop a condition known as copper deficiency myelopathy.

In 2015, the district court issued an order granting Defendants' *Daubert*¹ motion to exclude all or part of the testimony of Plaintiffs' general causation expert witnesses. The parties stipulated that this order was case-dispositive, meaning that without the ability to prove general causation, Plaintiffs could not prevail. Given that stipulation, the district court issued orders dismissing the Plaintiffs' cases with prejudice. In its orders of dismissal, the court referenced the 2015 *Daubert* order, as well as a 2013 order precluding testimony by any treating physicians of Plaintiffs who had not produced Rule 26(a)(2)(B) reports.

Plaintiffs now appeal these orders of dismissal and, more particularly, the *Daubert* and Rule 26(a)(2)(B) orders identified above. After carefully reviewing the parties' briefs and the record, and with the benefit of oral argument, we find no reversible error in either of the district court's orders.

AFFIRMED.

¹ Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc., 509 U.S. 579 (1993).